Instructional Comprehensive Program Review Template

Directions: Enter your narrative responses after the questions. Upload report(s) that you reference in each narrative.

Submitter: Soledad McCarthy   Submission Date: 4/4/2022

CONNECTION TO THE COLLEGE

1.A.   **DIVISION**: Business, Education, and Professional Programs
    PROGRAM NAME: Real Estate

1.B.   **YEAR OF REVIEW**: AY 2021-22

1.C.   **PROGRAM REVIEW TEAM**: Soledad McCarthy, Allan Nuttall, Grace Beltran, Dean Michael Kane

1.D.   **CONNECTIONS TO THE COLLEGE MISSION/VISION/VALUES**:

i.   Describe the program, its purpose, and how it contributes to Skyline College's Mission, "To empower and transform a global community of learners."

The Real Estate Department prepares students for the California Real Estate Exam. We are empowering and transforming our students to have the opportunity to be a Real Estate agent in the competitive Bay Area Real Estate Market

ii.   Alignment with the College Values

Place a check next to the Skyline College Values that are integral to your program's operations; for each value checked, provide a concrete example of how the value connects to your programs.

☐ **Social Justice**: We are committed to a comprehensive diversity framework that promotes social justice throughout all policies, procedure, and practices of the College.

☐ **Campus Climate**: We value a campus-wide climate that reflects a 'students first philosophy' with mutual respect between all constituencies and appreciation for diversity. Both instruction and student services are dedicated to providing every student with an avenue to success.

☐ **Open Access**: We are committed to the availability of quality educational programs and services for every member of our community regardless of level of preparedness, socioeconomic status, gender, gender expression, sexual orientation, cultural, religious, or

ethnic background, or disability status. We are committed to providing students with open access to programs and responsive student services both in person and online that enable them to advance steadily toward their goals.

☒ **Student Success and Equity**: We value students' success in achieving their goals, on time, and strengthening their voices as they transform their lives through their educational experience. We aim to identify and address equity gaps through evidence-based research to ensure that each student has the opportunity to succeed.

After analysis of the department, the Real Estate Department decided to offer ALL Spring courses online and ALL fall classes in person. This allows students to choose the modality that works best for their schedules and their learning style.

☒ **Academic Excellence**: We value excellence in all aspects of our mission as a comprehensive community college offering preparation for transfer to a baccalaureate institution, workforce and economic development through career technical education programs and certificates, Associate of Arts and Associate of Science degrees, a Baccalaureate Degree, basic skills development, and lifelong learning. We are committed to academic rigor and quality with relevant, recent, and evolving curricula and well-equipped programs that include new and emerging areas of study. We are dedicated to an educational climate that values creativity, innovation and freedom of intellectual exploration, discovery, thought, and exchange of ideas.

After analysis of the program, the Real Estate Department decided to offer ALL Spring courses online and ALL fall classes in person. This allows students to choose the modality that works best for their schedules and their learning style. This model allows students to choose all online or all in person for their course offerings.

☐ **Community Partnership**: We value a deep engagement with a community we serve through collaborating with local school districts, industry, non-profits, government and the arts. Valuing our role as an academic and cultural center, we are dedicated to meeting the needs of the labor market and community.

☐ **Participatory Governance**: We value just, fair, inclusive, and well understood, transparent governance processes based upon open and honest communication.

☐ **Sustainability**: We value an institutional culture that is committed to environmental sustainability and justice. We are committed to the tenet of sustainability, "To meet present needs without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their needs."

1.E. PROGRAM PERSONNEL

   i. Provide the current FTE of each category of personnel:

- FT Faculty FTE: 0

- Adjunct Faculty FTE: 1

- Classified Professionals FTE: 0

- Manager/ Director FTE:

- Dean FTE (if applicable): 1

   ii. Describe any changes in staffing since the last CPR, and how the change(s) have impacted the program.

   ☒ Not Applicable

   iii. Are there any unmet needs in the program pertaining to program personnel (e.g. staffing, schedule limitations, turnover)? If yes, please specify.

   ☒ Not Applicable

1.F. PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

   i. Summarize key professional development that the program personnel have engaged in since the last CPR to meet

- the mission of the program,
- the aim of the college to increase equity.

   27 Hours -California Mortgage Lending, 3 Hours Agency, 3 hours-Fair Housing , 3 hours-Trust Funds, 3 Hours- Ethic, 3 hours- Risk Management.

   The Real Estate instructor directly links to the mission of The College by being a life-long learner.

   ii. Are there any unmet needs pertaining to professional development? Please specify.

   ☒ Not Applicable

CURRENT STATUS

2.A.1. STATUS OF PRIOR COMPLETED OR DISCONTINUED GOAL – Goal # 1

Instructional Comprehensive Program Review Template

If no goals are completed or discontinued, leave 2.A.1 through 2.A.5 blank. Rather, provide responses in [Section 5.B](#) for ongoing and/or revised goals.

GOAL, YEAR INITIATED, AND MEASURE OF SUCCESS IF NOT REFERENCED IN GOAL

Develop Real Estate Certificate

STATUS: ☐ Completed ☒ Discontinued

SUPPORTING NARRATIVE FOR EACH GOAL'S STATUS

- Completed – Note the accomplishment and to what extent the measure of success was met.
- Discontinued – Explain why.

A Real Estate Certificate would not allow a student to work as a broker. The set of courses prepares student to take the CA state exam.

IMPLEMENTATION STEP(S)

GOAL ALIGNMENT WITH COLLEGE VALUE(S)

☐ Social Justice

☐ Campus Climate

☐ Open Access

☐ Student Success and Equity

☐ Academic Excellence

☐ Community Partnership

☐ Participatory Governance

☐ Sustainability

2.B. ACHIEVEMENTS

Describe the program's achievements since the last CPR (beyond what was addressed in 2.A).

Consideration may include, but not limited to:

- Successful and/or innovative programming, initiatives and plans
- Fruitful collaborations beyond the program
- New or updated curriculum
- In-reach/outreach efforts
- Technology or operational improvements
- Successful use of data to improve student outcomes and equity

- Maintenance of high levels of excellence
- New degrees, certificates, and/or pathways

The curriculum was updated in 2021. Enrollments for the three course courses for each year have climbed from 136 in 2018 to 230 in 2021.

2.C.   IMPACTS ON PROGRAM

Describe the impacts on your program (positive or negative) by legislation, regulatory changes, accreditation, grantors, community/school partnerships, college-wide initiatives, stakeholders, and/or other factors.

Our program is consistently impacted by fluctuations in the real estate market.

ACCESS

3.A.   PROGRAM ENROLLMENT

What enrollment trends do you observe, and what may account for these trends?

The enrollment for RE 100, RE 110, and RE 130 are all down from 15-16 to 19-20 approximately 60%. We were previously offering all classes in person, then the 3 main courses each semester but some courses were in person and some were online. Because students only need to take 3 courses to prepare for the Real Estate exam, they typically take all 3 courses in 1 semester. Student either wanted to take all their classes online or all in person

3.B.   EQUITABLE ACCESS

Provide an analysis of how students, particularly historically disadvantaged students, are able to access the program.

i.   PROGRAM ACCESS: How do your program enrollment demographics compare to that of the College as a whole? What differences, if any, are revealed? What program, institutional, and/or external factors may have impacted equitable access, whether positively or adversely?

Overall the Real Estate program was comprised of 44% females, 50% males and 5.5% unreported from 2015-2020 as compared to The College with 52.7% females, 44.6% Males and 2.6% unreported. The College's female representation is 8% higher than the program.

Additionally, the Real Estate Program did better than The College overall for enrollment from 2015-2020 of American Indian/Alaska Natives, Asians and Black-Non-Hispanic students. During 2019-2020, The Real Estate Program had 6.4% Black Students (compared to 2.4% for Skyline College), 36.2% Hispanic students (compared to 31.3% for Skyline College), and 2.1% Pacific Islander (compared to 1.4% for Skyline College).

ii.   COURSE ACCESS: Provide analysis of course enrollment trends for all active courses.

After analysis of enrollment trends. The program realized that some courses were being

offered in person while others were offered online every semester. This did not provide access to students who wanted all in person classes or students who wanted all online courses. The program switched scheduling to accommodate student access and learning styles. We now offer Real Estate courses online in the spring and in person in the fall.

iii. What efforts, if any, have been made to increase equitable access to your program (e.g., curricular and pedagogical changes to the courses; when it is offered; modality options – face-to-face, online, hybrid; recommended course sequencing; integration into guided pathways; adoption of OER/ZTC texts, etc.)? If more is needed, consider making it one of your program goals in the Action Plan.

Our goal is to implement ZTC into the program

EFFECTIVENESS

4.A. OVERALL AND DISAGGREGATED COURSE SUCCESS RATES

Provide analysis of course success rates overall and disaggregated by student demographics.

i. How do the course success rates overall compare to the College success rates?

Since 15/16 the course success has consistently remained higher than that of the college overall. In 20/21 success rates for all students were 77%, 10% above the campus at 67%.

ii. What have you learned from reviewing the overall and disaggregated course success data? Choose disaggregations which are most relevant to programming decisions (e.g. ethnicity, gender, age, enrollment status, and/or disaggregations that are unique to your program).

Since 15/16 the course success has consistently remained higher than that of the college overall. In 20/21 success rates for all students were 77%, 10% above the campus at 67%. In disaggregating the data the success among Female (77%), Male (74%), and Unreported (74%) shows that success is high for all genders, which has a 10% higher success rate in Female and Male students in all courses.

iii. If outcomes reveal inequity, what may be contributing factors at the program, college, and/or district level?

In reviewing disaggregated race/ethnicity we noticed that we have no data in AI/AN since 15/16, minimal Pacific Islanders, and a drastic drop from 84% to 0% in Black/African American students since 16/17. We plan on researching the trend in the declining/non existing interest and success in those populations so we may plan engagement and outreach accordingly.

4.B. INDIVIDUAL COURSE SUCCESS RATES

Provide analysis of individual course success rates.

The individual course success rates are as follows:

RE 100   56.4%

RE 110   65.4%

RE 130   46.2%

RE 131.   60%. The Real Estate Finance I course has the greatest success rates of all courses.

4.C.   INSTITUTIONAL SLO RESULTS

When possible, concurrently assess course SLOs and ISLOs.

Report on the last six years of ISLO results. Indicate if the results met the benchmark or were inconclusive. Additional commentary is optional.

ISLO	YEAR(S) ASSESSED	COURSE(S) TO ASSESS THE ISLO	RESULTS
CITIZENSHIP	6	RE 100 RE 110 RE 131	Meets Benchmark in understanding the interconnected issues that affect real estate, the effect of their experiences and values on their perspective, and how it is applied in their ethical perspectives.
CRITICAL THINKING	6	RE 100 RE 110 RE 131	Meets Benchmark so students are able to assist clients and self with knowledge required to buy/sell homes with the ability to evaluate evidence, be aware of and respond to bias, and apply analysis to achieve the desired outcome.
EFFECTIVE COMMUNICATION	6	RE 100 RE 110 RE 131	A main requirement in all real estate transactions is the ability to analyze and comprehend oral, written and other sensory information, especially when messages and infomration is shared between many different involved parties
INFORMATION LITERACTY	6	RE 100 RE 110 RE 131	Real Estate is guided by several rules and students are required to access information in all formats and be able to assess its relevancy for each client/location

LIFELONG WELLNESS	6	RE 100 RE 110 RE 131	If taking the course for their own knowledge or for future clients, they must be able to assess and identify personal needs, determining resources, and develop attitudes to lifelong learning.

4.D. COURSE AND PROGRAM SLO RESULTS

Upload the relevant *Improve* (formerly *Tracdat*) SLO reports showing the last six years of results that you reference in the narrative.

Drawing from 4.C. and 4.D., what notable conclusions were drawn from the assessment results? If available, note any differences in assessment results by key disaggregations (e.g. modality,

learning communities, etc.). What have been the implications for the program?

i.   How well is the program meeting its PSLOs?

For programs that assess PSLOs by "rolling up" course level SLO results,

- Which courses or course level SLOs do students struggle with, and which have "inconclusive" results, if any? Speculate why.
- If course level SLO results were quantified, identify the total number of students whose work met the benchmark, and the total number of students whose work was assessed, and then calculate the total percentage of students whose work met the benchmark.

  In review of the Course Four Column Assessment all courses in the last reporting cycle from 2017/2018 has continued to show the increase in benchmarks based on a 100-question final exam: RE 100 84% - RE 110 81.8% - RE 130 93.3% - RE 131 93.3%

ii.   Are the PSLOs still relevant to your program? If not, what changes might be made?

I would like to clarify, the Real Estate Department is not a program and therefore does not have degrees and certificates.

iii. Drawing from the last six years of course SLO assessment, which courses beyond the ones mentioned in 4.D.i. had results that led to action(s) that were planned or taken?

☐ Not Applicable

4.E. COURSE ENHANCEMENTS

Which course(s) are of concern due to their course success rates, SLO results, and/or other reasons? What efforts, if any, have been made to enhance student learning in those courses (e.g., curricular and pedagogical changes to the courses; course sequencing, including complementary general education courses; adoption of OER/ZTC text; assessment design; collaborations with other areas of campus, etc.)? If more is needed, consider which changes may be submitted to the Curriculum Committee in the Fall, and/or making it one of your

program goals in the Action Plan.

We plan to adopt ZTC for our Real Estate Courses

4.F.   DEGREES AND CERTIFICATES

☒ Not Applicable

List each of the degrees and certificates separately.

Provide analysis of degrees and certificates attainment, disaggregating by the demographics that are relevant to your program.

i.   What do the data reveal about

- degree and certificate completion?
- time to completion?
- equity?

ii.   What changes do the data suggest are necessary for the program to explore?

4.G.   LABOR MARKET CONNECTION

☐ Not Applicable

If appropriate for your program, given labor market data related to your program, discuss current labor trends and how your program is addressing them. How are you incorporating assessment information, recommendations form any advisory boards, and other external indicators into program planning? Report out on the following source(s) that are relevant to your program. Attach data.

i.   Labor Market and Trends (e.g. Centers of Excellence, Burning Glass)

San Francisco-Oakland-Hayward is the second top location for Real Estate Agents in California. The median salary is 41K. There is a projected growth of 16.2% in the next 10 years.

ii.   Performance for CTE Programs (Launchboard)

iii.   Advisory boards

4.H.   STUDENT FEEDBACK

Briefly describe how and when feedback was solicited from students, whether qualitative or quantitative, and what the results reveal.

The College solicited feedback from 693 students and received 43 responses which accounts for 6 % participation. The timeframe was students from summer 2017-summer 2021.

The Results revealed that 62% of our students are taking classes to prepare for the Real Estate License. 37% of our students are taking courses because they are interested in purchasing property.

48% of students have not taken the exam but plan to, while 26% have passed the exam. 15% of students do not plan on taking the exam and only 11% have taken exam and did not pass.

4.I.   CURRICULUM

Programs are required to update all curriculum and secure approval by the Curriculum Committee. Please check the boxes to indicate that the following tasks have been completed.

☒ Secured approval of updated courses by the Curriculum Committee

☒ Updated Improve with new or changed SLOs, and requested from PRIE the addition of new courses in order to input SLOs

☐ Not Applicable

☐ Submitted a current assessment calendar with all active courses to the Office of Planning, Research, and Institutional Effectiveness

☐ Reviewed, updated (as needed), and submitted degree and certificate maps to the Curriculum Committee

ACTION PLAN

Using key findings based on the analysis from this CPR cycle, develop a multi-year plan designed to improve program effectiveness and promote student learning and achievement.

Identify one-to-five goals total: ongoing, revised, and/or new goals.*

5.A.   CHALLENGES AND CONCERNS

Considering the results of this year's CPR assessment, identify challenges, concerns, and areas in which further action is needed. Reference relevant sections of the CPR that provide further insight.

At this time the singular department goal is to serve students who wish to be prepared for the CA state real estate exam. Enrollments have been increasing over the last several years and at this time that meets our goals.

5.B.1.   ONGOING OR REVISED GOAL – Goal # 1

Instructional Comprehensive Program Review Template
If no goals are ongoing or revised, leave 5.B.1 through 5.B.5 blank.

GOAL, YEAR INITIATED, AND MEASURE OF SUCCESS IF NOT REFERENCED IN GOAL

Successful marketing of courses: we need to spend some time reviewing and updating our web page and also marketing our new course scheduling approach.

STATUS

☒ Ongoing ☐ Revised for this cycle

SUPPORTING NARRATIVE FOR EACH GOAL'S STATUS

- Ongoing
  a) Roughly how much of the goal has been implemented – 25/50/75%?
  b) What has been accomplished thus far?
  c) What has been the impact of resources that were provided? ☒ Not Applicable
  d) What are challenges not already documented? ☒ Not Applicable
- Revised – Explain how and why the goal has been revised: implementation plan? timelines? Measures of success?

Roughly 25% of the goal has been accomplished in terms of creating the course schedule and stabilizing the scheduling plans. Our next steps will be to work on the website as well as working with marketing on finding avenues to market the new format.

REMAINING IMPLEMENTATION STEP(S) AND TIMELINE

We should be completed by August, 2022

GOAL ALIGNMENT WITH COLLEGE VALUE(S)

☐ Social Justice

☐ Campus Climate

☒ Open Access

☒ Student Success and Equity

☐ Academic Excellence

☐ Community Partnership

☐ Participatory Governance

☐ Sustainability

RESOURCE REQUEST RATIONALES FOR ONGOING OR REVISED GOAL

☒ No Resource Request Needed

Which additional resources are needed (e.g., services from or partnerships with other areas of campus, instructional equipment, facilities, personnel, etc.)? How will they help to support the goal?

Note: Referencing the goal and implementation step(s), submit the request(s) that require funding to your dean by November 15.

5.B.2. ONGOING OR REVISED GOAL – Goal # 2

GOAL, YEAR INITIATED, AND MEASURE OF SUCCESS IF NOT REFERENCED IN GOAL

Create ZTC materials for courses

STATUS

☒ Ongoing ☐ Revised for this cycle

SUPPORTING NARRATIVE FOR EACH GOAL'S STATUS

- Ongoing
  a) Roughly how much of the goal has been implemented – 25/50/75%?
  b) What has been accomplished thus far?
  c) What has been the impact of resources that were provided? ☒ Not Applicable
  d) What are challenges not already documented? ☐ Not Applicable
- Revised – Explain how and why the goal has been revised: implementation plan? timelines? Measures of success?

Providing ZTC materials to students is a goal of the program. We have not implemented the goal, but are in the research phase of the implementation.

REMAINING IMPLEMENTATION STEP(S) AND TIMELINE

The goal needs to be implemented

GOAL ALIGNMENT WITH COLLEGE VALUE(S)

☐ Social Justice

☐ Campus Climate

☐ Open Access

☒ Student Success and Equity

☒ Academic Excellence

☐ Community Partnership

☐ Participatory Governance

☒ Sustainability

RESOURCE REQUEST RATIONALES FOR ONGOING OR REVISED GOAL

☐ No Resource Request Needed

Which additional resources are needed (e.g., services from or partnerships with other areas of campus, instructional equipment, facilities, personnel, etc.)? How will they help to support the goal?

Note: Referencing the goal and implementation step(s), submit the request(s) that require funding to your dean by November 15.

5.C.1. NEW GOAL – Goal # 1

If there are no new goals, leave 5.C.1 through 5.C.5 blank.

APPROVAL AND SIGNATURE

This document has been reviewed and approved by: Click or tap here to enter text. on Click or tap to enter a date.

Jessica Hurless

05/04/2022

Michael Kane

Michael Kane

05/05/2022

Danni Redding Lapuz

06/15/2022